Annex 2 to HSE University's Directive No. 6.18.1-01/2812-17, dated December 28, 2017

APPROVED by the HSE University's Academic Council, Minutes No. 13, dated December 22, 2017

Amended by the HSE University's Academic Council, minutes No. 03, dated March 30, 2018, HSE University's directive No. 6.18.1-01/1604-01, dated April 16, 2018;

HSE University's Academic Council, minutes No. 12, dated November 30, 2018, HSE University's directive No. 6.18.1-01/1601-09, dated January 16, 2019;

HSE University's Academic Council, minutes No. 13, dated December 21, 2018, HSE University's directive No. 6.18.1-01/0102-03, dated February 01, 2019;

HSE University's Academic Council, minutes No. 6, dated April 26, 2019, HSE University's directive No. 6.18.1-01/2905-03, dated May 29, 2019

Regulations on the Dissertation Committee at National Research University Higher School of Economics

#### 1. General Provisions

- 1.1. The Regulations on the Dissertation Committee at National Research University Higher School of Economics (hereinafter, the "Regulations" and "Dissertation Committee", respectively) set forth the requirements for the Committee at National Research University Higher School of Economics (hereinafter, "HSE University"), for nominating persons to the Dissertation Committees, the procedure for setting up and organizing the activities of the Dissertation Committees, the rights and obligations of HSE University in regards to the Dissertation Committees, as well as the requirements for defense of dissertations submitted by candidates seeking academic degrees of Candidate of Sciences or Doctor of Sciences.
- 1.2. These Regulations are developed as per Federal Law No. 148-FZ, dated May 23, 2016, "On Amending Article 4 of the Federal Law "On Science and State Scientific and Technological Policy"", Resolution No. 553 of the Government of the Russian Federation, dated May 11, 2017, which confirms the Regulations on the List of Scientific Organizations and Higher Education Institutions Entitled to Independently Award Academic Degrees, as well as the Conceptual Framework for Awarding Academic Degrees at HSE University, approved by the HSE University's Academic Council on September 29, 2017 (Minutes No. 9). Furthermore, these Regulations cite materials from the Regulations on Awarding Academic Degrees, approved by Resolution No. 842 of the Government of the Russian Federation, dated September 24, 2013, and the Regulations on Dissertation Committees for the Awarding of Candidate of Sciences Degrees, and Doctor of Sciences Degrees, as approved by the Directive No. 1039 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation, dated November 10, 2017.

#### 2. Dissertation Committee Functions

- 2.1. The Dissertation Committee's activities shall be governed by the Constitution of the Russian Federation, federal constitutional laws, federal laws, directives and orders of the President of the Russian Federation, resolutions of the Russian Government, orders and directives of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation (hereinafter, the "Ministry of Education and Science"), and these Regulations.
- 2.2. The Dissertation Committee must be objective and make well-reasoned decisions with respect to judging whether dissertations properly meet the criteria set out by these Regulations when a candidate is contending for an academic degree, as well as

ensure that the review and defense of the candidates' dissertations are conducted in line with the Regulations for Awarding Academic Degrees at HSE University.

- 2.3. The Dissertation Committee's key functions include:
- developing and approving a passport for the academic field relating to the Dissertation Committee, including a short description of the given field and its key subject areas;
- drawing up recommendations in regards to the size and structure of a dissertation and its abstract related to the given field of study;
- drawing up requirements as for the character and number of publications a candidate should have with respect to the given academic field;
- determining a candidate's and his/her dissertation's compliance with the criteria established in the Regulations for Awarding Academic Degrees at HSE University;
  - deciding on accepting or rejecting dissertations for review;
- deciding on giving credit for a qualification exam in a given specialization passed at a different organization (for affiliated candidates);
- setting up Commissions under the Dissertation Committee to deal with issues related to the latter's competencies;
  - approving a dissertation's topic (for seekers of a Doctor of Sciences degree);
- forming and approving the membership of dissertation subcommittees, including candidacies of their chairpersons (co-chairpersons), as well as changes to the memberships of such subcommittees;
- putting together and staffing a pool of internal and external experts to sit on respective dissertation subcommittees;
- deciding on holding preliminary discussions on a dissertation and determining the field-specific subdivision at HSE University where this discourse should take place; approving the results of dissertation defense and deciding on awarding a Candidate or a Doctor of Sciences degree (Ph.D. HSE and DS HSE, respectively);
  - deciding on the awarding of cum laude (with honours) recognition;
- if necessary, organizing additional expert reviews of a dissertation (including checks for the citing made in bad faith) and observing rules for its defense;

- deciding against the awarding of an academic degree if the candidate has been proved to have provided unreliable information, as per these Regulations;
- issuing additional review statements on the dissertations defended before another dissertation committee in cases provided for in the Regulations for Awarding Academic Degrees;
- reviewing appeals with respect to such issues related to the awarding of academic degrees as violations of the procedure for nomination for defense and defense process itself, and subsequently issuing statements on the appeal review results;
- reviewing requests for the withdrawal of academic degrees, which were awarded in violation of the criteria specified in the Regulations for Awarding Academic Degrees, the reinstatement of academic degrees; and issuing review statements with the results;
- carrying out annual reviews of its activities, including the contents of dissertations defended;
- engaging in other activities established by the Regulations for Awarding Academic Degrees at HSE University.

#### 3. Dissertation Committee Formation

- 3.1. The Dissertation Committees, which are formed as per these Regulations, shall be created for major academic fields (e.g., fields as per the OECD classification). Furthermore, a committee shall be formed in accordance with the fields pursued at HSE University as long as a sufficient number of academic specialists who meet the necessary requirements are available. One dissertation committee shall be set up for each academic field.
- 3.2. The HSE University's Academic Council may decide on the formation of a Dissertation Committee upon the proposal of the head of a field-specific research and educational subdivision at HSE University. A proposal for the creation of a dissertation committee should include the reasons explaining the need for its creation with respect to the stated academic field; information on academic and teaching staff with expertise in areas under the given academic field; information on academic research in the given field; nominations for staffing the committee with information on these candidates' academic titles, their publication stats and citation rates over the preceding 5 (five) years in the Web of Science, Scopus, other international and Russian indices and citation databases. Furthermore, one can refer to the list of leading journals put together by HSE University at <a href="https://scientometrics.hse.ru/goodjournals">https://scientometrics.hse.ru/goodjournals</a>.

3.3. In order to enhance the independence and objectivity of state academic certification of academic and teaching staff, dissertation committees may be formed on the basis of several organizations (hereinafter, "joint dissertation committee"). A joint dissertation committee may involve no more than 4 (four) organizations. A joint dissertation committee shall be created on the basis of organizations renowned for their accomplishments in key areas of knowledge, which have approved the Regulations for Awarding Academic Degrees equivalent to those approved at HSE University, as per the agreement on the creation of the joint dissertation committee.

## 4. Dissertation Committee Staffing

4.1. A Dissertation Committee shall consist of a chairperson, co-chairs (as appropriate), a deputy chairperson(-s), an academic secretary, and respective members.

No more than two co-chairs can sit on a Dissertation Committee.

- 4.2. The position of the Committee chairperson (co-chairs) and his/her deputies shall be staffed with leading researchers specializing in the academic field designated to the Dissertation Committee.
- 4.3. The Dissertation Committee's academic secretary must be an in-house employee of the organization where the Committee is based, and specialize in its field of focus.
- 4.4. The staffing of the Dissertation Committee, as well as nominations for the positions of chairperson (co-chairs), deputy chairperson(-s) and academic secretary of the Committee, must be approved by the HSE University's Academic Council, for a term of 1 to 3 years, and upon the expiration of the first term, for 1 to 5 years.
- 4.5. Candidates for membership on the Dissertation Committees shall be nominated following the recommendation of the head of the relevant field-specific subdivision at HSE University.
- 4.6. Changes to the staffing of the Dissertation Committee, including the replacement of its chairperson (co-chair), deputy chairperson(-s) or academic secretary, co-optation of new members on the Committee, and dismissal of members thereof, shall be enacted as per the decision of the HSE University's Academic Council upon the recommendation of the Dissertation Committee's chairperson (co-chair). His/her recommendation should include the written consent of the newly inducted members for their participation in the Committee's activities and for the processing of their personal data.
- 4.7. Information on the composition of the Dissertation Committee and changes thereto shall be published on the HSE University's official website (portal).

## 5. Requirements for Dissertation Committee Members

- 5.1. Members of the Dissertation Committee shall include persons holding a Doctor of Sciences degree, Ph.D. (including foreign degrees, if such an academic degree is recognized in the Russian Federation) and a Candidate of Sciences degree (if demonstrate high indicators in their publishing activities and have an impressive citation rate). The proportion of persons with a Candidate of Sciences degree on the Committee cannot exceed ¼ of its membership.
- 5.2. The total number of members of the Dissertation Committee must not come to less than 15 (fifteen) persons. Furthermore, the overall number of Committee members should not exceed 29 (twenty-nine) persons.
- 5.3. The total number of members of a Dissertation Committee, who are also HSE University's staff members, should account for at least 50 percent of the Committee's membership.
- 5.4. A member cannot sit on more than 2 (two) HSE University's Dissertation Committees at the same time.
- 5.5. Members should represent as many subject areas of the Committee's given academic field as possible.
- 5.6. The criteria for members of a Dissertation Committee shall be developed with due consideration of the specifics of the given academic field. Such key requirements include a candidate's publication activities in the given academic field confirmed by indicators from benchmark bibliometric systems.
- 5.7. The academic secretary of the Dissertation Committee may not fully meet the requirements for the Committee's members. The Dissertation Committee decides if its academic secretary may not have the decisive vote.
- 5.7. The minimum requirements for the number of publications authored by members of the Dissertation Committee over the preceding 5 (five) years must not be lower than the figure set by the Higher Commission for Academic Degrees and Titles of the Russian Federation. Works in RSCI-listed publications may be replaced by publications included in international citation databases and publications included in the University's alternative list of leading journals (https://scientometrics.hse.ru/goodjournals). Publications in journals included on HSE University's blacklist (https://scientometrics.hse.ru/blacklist) shall not be considered. Requirements (or lack thereof) for the publication of a peer-reviewed monography shall be decided by the Dissertation Committee with due consideration of the specifics of the given academic field.

## 6. Organizing Dissertation Committee Activities

- 6.1. The Dissertation Committee works under conditions of openness, which, in turn, should foster the conditions conducive to defending a dissertation prepared by the candidate. A candidate shall be acquainted with the materials in the possession of the Dissertation Committee regarding the dissertation defense process, as well as receive qualified assistance of the Committee in regard to any issues related to the defense process.
- 6.2. Meetings of the Dissertation Committee shall be held under the guidance of its chairperson (co-chair), or, in case of his/her absence, under the guidance of the deputy chairperson (co-chair) as per the written instruction of the Dissertation Committee's chairperson (co-chair) and/or the HSE University's Vice Rector responsible for coordinating the activities of Dissertation Committees. Decisions of the Dissertation Committees shall be recorded in its minutes.
- 6.3. The chairperson (co-chair) (deputy chairperson) of the Dissertation Committee cannot preside over Committee meetings during the review of a dissertation defended by a candidate for whom the chairperson is an academic supervisor or academic advisor.
- 6.4. If the chairperson (co-chair) or deputy chairperson(-s), or the Dissertation Committee's academic secretary, is absent, their duties shall be performed by one of the Dissertation Committee members for a determined period (but for no more than 4 (four) months), following the directive of the HSE University's Vice Rector charged with coordination of the activities of Dissertation Committees.
- 6.5. If the chairperson (co-chair), deputy chairperson(-s) and the academic secretary are all absent at the same time, their duties must not be passed on to other members of the Committee by the organization where the Dissertation Committee is based.
  - 6.6. The chairperson (co-chair) of a Dissertation Committee shall:
  - oversee the activities of the Dissertation Committee;
- make proposals to the HSE University's administration as to the Committee's membership and changes thereto;
  - preside over Committee's meetings;
- take part in the development of regulations governing the Committee's activities and make sure such regulations are followed;
  - retain the right to sign documents related to the Committee's activities;

	oordinate with outside organizations with respect to the Committee's uding the decisions made by it.
6.7. The	e deputy chairperson of a Dissertation Committee shall:
	versee and bear responsibility for the quality of the Committee's work if n (co-chair) is not present;
•	reside over the Committee's meetings if the chairperson (co-chair) is an ervisor of the dissertation under review, or if the chairperson (co-chair) is
	ign, as per the instructions of the chairperson (co-chair) of the Dissertation ocuments related to its activities.
6.8. The	e Dissertation Committee's academic secretary shall:
	arry out preliminary checks of candidates and their dissertations against the view and defense criteria;
— cł	heck the documents of candidates at various stages of their defense;
— er	nsure a quorum at the Dissertation Committee meetings;
— oʻ	versee document management/processing by the Committee;
— 0'	versee the Committee's scheduling;
— рі	repare agendas for the Committee's meetings;
— oʻ	versee the preparation of documents for the Committee's meetings;
— or commissions;	versee the preparation of the statements of the Dissertation Committee's
activities (e.g. on the HSE	versee the publication of information on the Dissertation Committee's , its membership, results of a dissertation's defense and review processes) University's corporate portal (website) and in the Federal Information ate Academic Certification (hereinafter, the "Unified Information System);
— 0'	versee the work of the Dissertation Committee's clerk;
— cł	heck if dissertations, candidates and the Dissertation Committee members

6.9. The academic secretary, along with the Committee's chairperson (co-chair), shall retain the right to sign documents regarding the Committee's activities.

properly follow the established formal criteria.

6.10. Meetings of the Dissertation Committee shall be considered valid as long as at least 2/3 of its active members take part therein. The Dissertation Committee meetings for the defense of a Doctor of Sciences degree, however, shall be deemed valid if at least 2/3 of its active members, taking part therein, hold a Doctor of Sciences degree and a Ph.D.

Members of the Dissertation Committee who are holders of a Candidate of Sciences degree shall not participate in the voting with respect to the decision to award a Doctor of Sciences academic degree.

The Dissertation Committee's members may take part in meetings by use of electronic means of communication (e.g., video-conferencing, electronic voting services).

- 6.11. A Dissertation Committee's meeting shall be deemed valid based on an attendance list of its members, indicating the last names and initials of members who have taken part, as well as the date of the meeting. Attendance lists shall be signed off by the presiding (co-presiding) party and the Dissertation Committee's academic secretary. The Dissertation Committee's members who take part in the meetings via electronic means of communications shall confirm their attendance by e-mail.
- 6.12. Decisions of a Dissertation Committee (with the exception of those for awarding academic degrees) shall be made by a simple majority of votes. A decision of the Dissertation Committee to award a Doctor or Candidate of Sciences degree shall be enacted following its approval by at least 2/3 of the members in attendance.
- 6.13. The Dissertation Committee shall annually present a report on its activities to the HSE University's Rector.

# 7. Procedure for Halting, Restarting and Terminating the Activities of the Dissertation Committee

- 7.1. The activities of a Dissertation Committee may be halted based on a directive issued by the HSE University's Rector under the following circumstances:
- identification of the Dissertation Committee's failure to meet the requirements established by these Regulations;
- provision of inaccurate information about the Dissertation Committee's members;
- identification of the Dissertation Committee's violation of the procedure for its work as established in these Regulations;
- unfeasibility of further activities on the part of the Dissertation Committee depending on its performance.

- 7.2. To renew the activities of a Dissertation Committee, its chairperson (co-chair) should submit documentary evidence that violations and non-compliance with the requirements of these Regulations, which were the reason for halting its activities, have been eliminated. The Dissertation Committee's activities shall be then restarted following the directive of the HSE University's Rector.
- 7.3. If violations of the requirements for a Dissertation Committee or procedure for its work, as provided for in these Regulations, are not rectified within 6 (six) months from the date when its activities were halted, the HSE University's Academic Council, upon the recommendation of the HSE University's Rector, may decide to terminate the Dissertation Committee's work.
- 7.4. Directive of the HSE University's Rector for the discontinuation or restarting of the Dissertation Committee's activities, as well as decisions issued by the HSE University's Academic Council to halt the Dissertation Committee's work, shall be published on the HSE University's corporate website (portal).

### 8. Financing the Activities of the Dissertation Committee

- 8.1. HSE University is obligated to ensure the uninterrupted operation of Dissertation Committees based at HSE University, as well as any commissions or subcommittees formed therein.
- 8.2. The activities of a Dissertation Committee, its commissions and clerk shall be funded from HSE University's central budget and enacted by a directive of the Vice Rector responsible for coordinating the activities of Dissertation Committees. These funds shall be spent on the Committee's day-to-day operations and the work done by external experts hired on the basis of independent contractor agreements.
- 8.3. Each Dissertation Committee should have its own clerk funded from the HSE University's central budget. The Dissertation Committee's clerk shall:
- organize meetings of the Dissertation Committee, as well as its commissions and subcommittees:
- sign and monitor the execution of agreements with external experts in regards to their participation in the work of the Dissertation Committee, its commissions and subcommittees;
- provide document support for the activities of the Dissertation Committee (e.g., preparing meeting minutes, annual reports on the committee's activities, etc.);
- prepare and publish on the HSE University's corporate website (portal) and in the Unified Information System the review files of candidates for academic degrees;

- regularly monitor the compliance of the Dissertation Committee's membership with respect to relevant regulations, and prepare documents for introducing changes to the staffing of the Dissertation Committees;
- provide consulting and methodological assistance with respect to the current rules for organizing and carrying out dissertation defense for the purpose of awarding a Candidate (or Doctor) of Sciences degree;
- input data/information on the Dissertation Committee into the Unified Information System;
- receive Candidate (Doctor) of Sciences degree certificates/diplomas drawn up as per the established procedure and deliver them to candidates;
- inform the HSE University's administration and staff of the Office of Doctoral Studies in a timely manner about the Dissertation Committee's activities;
- publish in a timely manner full and accurate information on the activities of the Dissertation Committee and dissertation defense on the HSE University's corporate website (portal);
- carry out other obligations as per the Russian legislation and/or internal HSE University's bylaws, as well as instructions from the employer.
- 8.4. Members of a Dissertation Committee who are HSE University's in-house staff members shall perform their obligations on a voluntary basis as per their employment agreements (under the unified contract terms).
- 8.5. External experts may take part in the activities of the Committee and its subcommittees on a paid basis, including compensation for their travel, living and expertise services expenses. The usual amount of compensation for external experts shall be set by a directive of the HSE University's Rector. Any decisions on compensations beyond its set usual amount must be made by the Vice Rector responsible for coordinating the activities of Dissertation Committees.
- 8.6. Reimbursement of expenses related to the review and defense of a candidate's dissertation at the latter's expense is not permitted.